Faculty Confidence and Engagement Survey (FaCES) 2012 Open-Ended Responses

Analysis Report

Yao Hill

ofie@hawaii.edu

Office for Institutional Effectiveness

Leigh Dooley

ldooley@hawaii.edu

Department of Languages, Linguistics and Literature

Susan B. Inouye

inouye@hawaii.edu

Department of Languages, Linguistics and Literature

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report summarizes the open-ended responses on the Faculty Confidence and Engagement Survey (FaCES), administered in spring 2012. The open-ended questions address three purposes: (1) identifying impactful professional development (PD) activities/event; (2) identifying faculty/staff's perceptions of their PD needs; and (3) soliciting improvement strategies for the C4ward program, the main form of PD at the college.

Following thematic qualitative analysis procedure, the researchers found that the following activities impacted the largest number of individuals (number in parenthesis): C4wards (40); CELTT technology workshops (21), Distance education related technology workshops (20); and Engaged in Education (10).

The PD needs identified included: learning technology (28); pedagogical strategies and techniques (16); college processes and resources (13); life management (11), including health & wellness, life balance, and stress reduction (7); communication (7), including conflict management (5); and assessment related knowledge and skills (6).

Strategies identified for PD improvement included: to better advertise and market the C4ward program to the campus (8) through email blast, web development, and better communication at the Fall Convocation. Conflicting suggestions were made about the C4ward structure (9). Based on responses, the researchers identified the need for space, administrative and assessment support, and providing specific technology and pedagogical workshops focused on immediately applicable skills.

The respondents were given an opportunity to provide addition comments after they rated KCC PD offerings. Most respondents (24) in the comment box explained their non-participation as a result of heavy workload and time conflicts. Nine respondents made suggestions and seven respondents made positive comments. Seven made negative comments and three of these focused on the lack of evidence of PD effectiveness. PD leaders are recommended to maintain their assessment and evaluation efforts and continue to improve PD effectiveness in the next three-year planning period.

INTRODUCTION

The Faculty Confidence and Engagement Survey (FaCES) was administered online between 2/14/2012 and 2/27/2012 through emailing to the Kapiʻolani Community College (KCC)'s faculty and staff listserve. A total of 197 faculty and staff at KCC responded to the survey. In the survey administered in Spring 2012, three open-ended questions were added to FaCES. Certain close-ended questions also allow open-ended comments. The three open-ended questions aim to understand:

(1) among the PD activities in which faculty/staff at KCC participated, **which are believed to have made an impact;**

(2) **what faculty/staff's perceived PD needs are; and**

(3) **how the respondents think C4wards (the main form of PD at KCC) can improve.**

These three research questions correspond to three survey items, and they are:

- *Question 7: List the Kapiʻolani CC professional development program(s) that you feel have had the most impact on your professional development.*

- *Question 14: What knowledge and skills would you like to learn through professional development offerings at KCC?*

- *Question 15: What suggestions do you have for the Professional Development Leadership Team to improve the C4ward initiative?*

Respondents were also asked to provide comments on *Question 13: How would you evaluate the professional development offerings at KCC,* after they gave ratings to the closed-ended items on PD quality, variety, and timeliness.

This report details the analysis procedure and the result of the analysis of all three open-ended questions and one open-ended comment question asking respondents to evaluate the professional development (PD) offerings at KCC. Possible implications of the results are discussed after reporting the result for each question. In the end, the open-ended responses are attached in Appendixes organized by the coding scheme used by the authors.

ANALYSIS

All three authors participated in the analysis. The following procedure was followed to analyze the responses to each open-ended question.

1. Unitization: the meaning units of each response given by one respondent were identified and separated from each other. Each unit is coded and analyzed separately. For example,

the response "*I like their offerings. Technology is always a good idea*" has two meaning

units: (1) "*I like their offerings*" and (2) "*Technology is always a good idea.*"

2. Coding: each meaning unit was given a code. For example, "*Technology is always a good*

idea" as a suggestion was coded *technology in general*.

3. Tallying: After all the meaning units were coded, the frequency with which each code

occurs was tallied.

4. Categorization: the codes that are similar or fall under one conceptual umbrella were

categorized. For example, *technology in general*, *software*, *programming*, and *website*

development/maintenance were categorized under *Technology*.

5. Code book: the resulting categories and codes were made into a code book.

6. Member check: the first author recoded all the responses again following the code book

and made modifications as appropriate.

RESULT AND IMPLICATION

Question 7: List the Kapiʻolani CC professional development program(s) that you feel have
had the most impact on your professional development.

One hundred and six respondents answered this question. About 2/3 of them (n = 65)

named one professional development (PD) activity that had the most impact. Forty-one others

named more than one activity. Each of the 174 named activities was coded by two researchers.

Table 1 shows the categorization of the activities and the number of occurrences of the activities

in that category.

Table 1. Categorization of Impactful Professional Development Activities Ordered by Frequency

Categories of Activities	Responses
C4wards (e.g., Vanguard, concierge training)	40
CELTT Tech workshops	21
Distance education related technology workshops/trainings (e.g., Laulima, online teaching training)	20
Other	16
Engaged in Education (EE)	10
None	7
Conferences	6
NSF sponsored activities	6
Scenarios	6
Transformed for Learning Cohort (TLC)	6
Department workshop/events	4
The Real World Academics Professional Learning Teams Program	4
Service-Learning Institute	4
SLO/Assessment activities	4
Wo funded PD (e.g., WILD, Wo Learning Champion)	4
Contract renewal & tenure/promotion workshops	3
Writing across the curriculum institutes/workshops	3
Counselor focused PD	2
Curriculum development workshops	2
Learning Communities Institute/participation	2
New Faculty Orientation	2
Webinar	2
Total	174

The most frequently mentioned PD activities were C4wards, which were named by 38% (40 out of 106) respondents. Within C4wards, the Vanguard circle (n = 5) and concierges concierge training (n = 5) were particularly mentioned. Technology related workshops offered by CELTT (n = 21) and distance education technology training offered by CELTT and the UH system (n = 20) were also prominently mentioned as impactful PD activities. Within distance education technology training, Laulima and distance learning training workshops (n = 18) were particularly mentioned. Other important impactful PD activities recognized by five or more respondents were: Engaged in Education activities, national/local conferences, NSF sponsored activities, such as the SENCER conference, Scenarios, and Transformed for Learning Cohorts (now also a C4ward circle).

The implications of this finding are the following:

1. The college should continue to offer and support the PD activities that were recognized by most participants as impactful. These activities include C4wards and technology workshops, particularly those supporting distance learning activities offered by CELTT or other organizations.

2. The college can consider increasing the opportunities of PD activities that were not well-recognized by the respondents as impactful, but are essential for the college to increase implementation of high-impact practices for students to engage, learn, and achieve academic success and to achieve the goals of the strategic plan. Examples of such activities are: SLO/assessment training, service learning training, curriculum development training, writing across the curriculum training, and learning communities training and support. These activities were mentioned by fewer than five respondents each.

Question 13: How would you evaluate the professional development offerings at KCC?

Forty-seven respondents provided comments or explanations to Question 13, asking them to evaluate the PD offerings at KCC. These comments were categorized by two researchers and summarized in Table 2.

Based on the closed-ended question responses, between 13.5% (on the Availability criteria) to 21.1% (on the Timeliness criteria) of the respondents chose "Don't know" to this question. The open-ended comments revealed that 24 respondents did not participate in PD offerings at the campus mostly because they had heavy workloads related to teaching or other

professional obligations (e.g., committees), so that they did not have time to participate in PD activities (n = 9). PD was also not accessible to some respondents (n =7) because they either felt that PD offerings were only offered to instructional faculty or because some respondents were teaching off island. Four respondents were not full-time permanent faculty; two respondents were not contacted after signing up for C4ward circles. One respondent was not aware of PD activities on campus.

Seven respondents provided positive comments about PD activities. In additional to three general positive comments (e.g., "*good job", "excellent"*) there were also comments about the variety of the PD offered (e.g., "*I feel very fortunate to work at KCC because there are so many useful professional development opportunities*" "*There is a C4ward for just about everything*"), the excellent PD leaders (e.g., "*Suan [sic] Banner Inouye and leigh [sic] Dooley are AMAZING*"), and the support from the administration (e.g., "*...the administration has been very supportive*").

Seven respondents perceived or experienced problems in PD activities. Three commented on the lack of evidence of C4ward effectiveness (e.g., "*C-4 wards are not as active as administrators would believe and they don't usually have much impact outside their groups. Some are disconnected to the mission of the College...*"). One pointed out a dilemma that C4wards are facing: "*The only problem is that we don't have enough concierge [sic] to run all the suggested C4wards. But if we ran them all, there would be too many.*" One respondent complained about the complicated Faculty Development Council (FDC) process. Another respondent thought that the treatment of lecturers was problematic at the college.

Nine respondents offered suggestions to improve PD. These suggestions were to:
- offer more PD targeting staff or counselors
- support individual faculty projects
- during the summer, offer learning opportunities about teaching
- develop PD based on faculty needs
- offer workshops for short and immediate change
- change the term "concierge" for C4ward facilitators
- consolidate events to maximize participation
- create a center/office for PD activities

Each of the suggestions was made by one person. These suggestions should be analyzed together with the suggestions given in the responses to Question 15.   Table 2 shows the categorization of the comments and the number of occurrences of the comments in that category.

Table 2. Categorization of Comments on Evaluation of Professional Development Offerings at KCC Item Ordered by Frequency

Explanation	Responses
Non-participation	24
Workload issue (9)	
Accessibility issue (7)	
New or transient status (4)	
Communication issue (2)	
Awareness issue (1)	
No reason specified (1)	
Suggestion	9
Positive	7
Negative	7
Not directly related	4
Grand Total	**51**

Question 14: What knowledge and skills would you like to learn through professional development offerings at KCC?

Out of 70 respondents, 67 provided usable data for analysis, excluding n/a's and non-meaningful responses. A total of 101 topics were identified as knowledge and skills desired by the faculty and staff to learn through PD offerings at the college. Among them, technology (n = 28) and pedagogy (n = 16) related topics are of greatest need. Eleven respondents mentioned that they wanted to improve skills using technology in general. Specific technology topics mentioned were how to use iPads in classroom, how to do web development and maintenance, implementing technology in classroom (though this was implied by faculty who mentioned technology in general), and software. Sixteen faculty mentioned that they want to learn strategies and techniques to improve teaching and student learning (e.g., problem-based learning, improving student engagement, teaching writing, grading). Three of them particularly mentioned interest in learning teaching online. Thirteen faculty/staff mentioned various topics that they want to learn related to college processes (e.g., accreditation and strategic planning, how to work with student employees, working with and impacting administration) and college resources (e.g., maximizing benefits). For details, see Table 3 under the header "College processes/Resources."

Health & wellness/life balance/stress management (under Life management) (n = 7), assessment (n = 6), conflict management (under communication) (n = 5), and time management (also under Life management) (n = 3) also emerged as important PD areas to be provided.

Table 3. Categorization of Knowledge and Skills Desired by Faculty to Learn Ordered by Frequency

Knowledge and Skills Desired	Responses	Knowledge and Skills Desired	Responses
Technology	**28**	**Communication**	**7**
Technology in general (11)		Conflict management (5)	
		Building and managing	
Ipad (4)		partnerships (1)	
Web development/maintenance (3)		Networking (1)	
Classroom technology (2)		**Assessment**	**6**
Software (2)		**Leadership**	**4**
Video editing (1)		Social change (2)	
Eportfolio (1)		Leadership (2)	
		Primary duty skill development	
Digital literature (1)		**other than teaching**	**4**
		Non-teaching faculty skill	
Programming (1)		development (1)	
Laulima (1)		Human resource management (1)	
Media (1)		Continuing education/students (1)	
Pedagogy	**16**	Counseling skills (1)	
Teaching/learning techniques/strategies (13)			
		Student needs	**3**
		Students with different learning	
Online pedagogy (3)		needs (1)	
College processes/Resources	**13**	Understanding student diversity (1)	
		Supporting students with disabilities	
Access resources/people (2)		(1)	
Processing travel documents (1)		**Scholarship**	**3**
Maximizing benefits (1)		Scholarship in discipline (2)	
Work with administration (1)		Courses in discipline (1)	
		Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual,	
		Transgender, and Intersex (LGBTI)	
Business oriented non-credit courses (1)		**Issues**	**2**
Planning and project management (1)		**Other**	**2**
Dossier support (1)		**Student development**	**2**
Research support (1)		Student leadership development (1)	
Grant writing (1)		Effective student mentorship (1)	
Accreditation, tactical plan writing (1)			
Working with student employees (1)			
How to impact administrative decisions (1)			
Life Management	**11**		
Health & wellness/life balance/stress management (7)			
Time management (3)			
First aid (1)		**Grand Total**	**104**

Question 15: What suggestions do you have for the Professional Development Leadership Team to improve the C4ward initiative?

Out of 49 respondents who provided a written response to this item, yielding 53 comment units, 12 of the comment units were not usable for analysis, including responses such as "*none*," "*n/a*," etc. .

Out of the remaining 41 comments, predominant suggestions were made in the areas of communication, advertising, and marketing; good job/continue the effort; membership; content; time; and the survey of needs. Specific suggestions are categorized and listed in Table 4.

The dominant reoccurring recommendation is for C4wards to communicate, advertise, and market (n = 8) what the C4ward initiative is about and how to participate, through email blasts, a website, a brief infomercial at the Fall Convocation, to publish the participant and group list for other interested faculty/staff to contact to "*ask questions, offer resources, and share best practices,*" and to find a way to let staff know more about the initiative.

The C4ward initiative was well-perceived by five respondents who praised C4wards (n = 2) and requested the C4ward program (n = 3) to "*keep up the good work.*"

Another dominant suggestion is to open C4ward to staff members as well (n = 4). Many C4wards are primarily designed for instructional faculty, but in reality all C4wards are open to all faculty and staff. The college needs to clarify that the target population includes staff and/or establish some number of C4wards designed to specifically address staff interests and concerns. It again reflects the need for better communication about C4wards and its inclusive nature. Because C4wards are open to staff, the C4ward initiative should probably involve staff professional development leaders to leverage support and resources and ensure that staff needs are being addressed appropriately.

Two respondents recommended a designated time for circles to gather/meet.

Two respondents recommended helping faculty do self-reflection and/or self-critique of their teaching practice in the C4ward circles. One person wrote, "*Help faculty critique themselves in terms of their methods and pedagogy, and then show them how to make substantive change that goes along with how to teach diverse, first-generation in College students, i.e. collaborative, hands on, team work, making change in communities, etc*." This recommendation is related to the other recommendation of the content of C4wards – to be more teaching and student learning oriented. Examples are: to invite pedagogy experts to give workshops on instructional strategies, to have "*student-driven topics,*" to have the circle "*applied directly to teaching…skill development, so that they [teachers] can do their job better.*"

Two respondents suggested that C4ward circle offerings should be based on faculty needs. Although C4ward circle topics are based on the needs identified from various sources (e.g., EE, deans and department chairs, individual faculty needs/interest), a more systematic investigation

of faculty needs in PD would be useful. The FaCES survey is the main instrument so far to serve this role. Institution-supported circles should be based on specific knowledge and skills desired by most faculty, addressing student engagement, learning, and achievement needs, and directly connected to our mission and strategic plan.

The suggestions in the area of structure revealed a dilemma that the C4ward initiative is facing. Some recommended less structure (e.g., keeping C4wards informal, having less "*cumbersome methods of assessment*") and some recommended that C4wards have more structure (e.g., "*Be more organized*," "*more structured goals*," "*need to build the connection with student success*"). It is interesting that all three respondents who recommended that C4wards be more structured identified themselves as academic or institutional support faculty or staff. The ones who suggested less structure are instructional faculty.

These seemingly conflicting suggestions can actually create an opportunity for communication between different stakeholders. The campus community needs to understand that it is important for C4wards to follow community of practice principles, in which members of the community come together on a voluntary basis and decide themselves the goals and the path to take to reach those goals. It is important to allow members to continuously refine their goals and paths as contexts and needs change. The campus community also needs to understand that the majority of the circles are led by concierges (i.e., group facilitators) who volunteer their time to help their colleagues learn from each other. Neither the concierges nor the large majority of the participants are compensated for their participation in C4wards. On the other hand, it is also important for the professional development leaders and C4ward participants to understand that the C4ward initiative is a major vehicle for PD on campus, that the college has invested in its implementation and is vested in its success, and that any PD, including C4wards, needs to demonstrate its effectiveness in helping students engage, learn, and achieve academically. In addition, the C4ward initiative as a PD model needs to demonstrate its success through systematic assessment and evaluation.

To reconcile the needs of different stakeholders for C4wards to be both informal and structured, and to take account of other recommendations, we recommend the college to consider a **Structured Informal Circle** model. In this model, the college would provide structured support to the circles, and the C4wards would be systematically evaluated. However, participants

would still participate or leave each circle as they chose and the goals and progress of the C4wards are controlled by each circle. Structured support can include:

1. Create opportunities for individual circles to take turns sharing what they have learned with the campus community.
2. Ensure that concierges know that student learning assessment and student engagement improvement assistance is available to their C4wards, especially for pedagogy-related or other relevant circles.
3. Invite campus, local, national or international experts in topics related to C4ward circles to work with the relevant circle(s) on their projects and to offer campus-wide workshop, which address student needs in engagement, learning, and academic achievement. Both external and campus funds can be leveraged for this purpose.
4. Create a website including information about the C4ward initiative's goals and target serving population; circle topics, concierges, and contact information; participant lists; an events calendar; announcements and news; and an archive for sharing the work of individual circles.
5. Create templates as resources for concierges to use with their circle participants as appropriate (e.g., self-reflection template, an assortment of assessment templates)
6. Establish a sense of place for C4ward activities. The best solution is to create an office, a room, or even a desk that can provide resources and direct faculty in PD needs.
7. Hire a staff person, and if that's not possible, a casual hire or student assistant that can help with C4ward website creation and maintenance, assessment data collection, and clerical tasks.

Table 4 shows the categorization of the suggestions and the number of occurrences of the suggestions in that category.

Table 4. Categorization of Suggestions to Improve C4ward Ordered by Frequency

Categories	Responses
Structure	**9**
Have ongoing reflection on goals (1)	
Have more groups (1)	
Build connection with student success (1)	
Change the name "concierge" (1)	
Be more organized (1)	
Have fewer meetings (1)	
Have structured goals (1)	
Keep it informal (1)	
Simplify assessment (1)	
Communication/Advertising/Marketing	**8**
More advertising/infomercial (5)	
Create a website (1)	
Publish a participant list (1)	
More marketing to staff (1)	
Content	**7**
Include faculty self-critique/reflection (2)	
Have student-driven topics (1)	
Share learning outside the circle (1)	
PD directly applicable to job duties.	
Work effectively with HR (1)	
Bring expert in instructional strategy (1)	
Offer occasional shorter-term PD (1)	
Membership	**5**
Open to staff (4)	
Have administration participate (1)	
Time	**3**
Designated time for c4ward sessions	
Flexible schedule for concierge training	
Good job/Continue the effort	**5**
Support	**2**
More administrative encouragement/support (1)	
Provide more incentive for PD participation (1)	
Survey of PD needs	**2**
End the C4ward	**1**
Grand Total	**41**

APPENDIX 1. QUESTION 7 OPEN-ENDED RESPONSES

Question 7: List the Kapi'olani CC professional development program(s) that you feel have had the most impact on your professional development.

C4ward

    C4, faculty scenarios, CELTT technology

    C4Ward

    C4ward (only one I have participated in)

    C4ward concierge training

    C4ward Concierge Training Scenarios Engaged in education

    c4ward concierge training Vanguard

    C4Ward Engaged Education

    C4ward for Early Career STEM Faculty

    C4ward mixer

    C4ward, Accreditation, Tools workshops from CELTT

    C4ward, Vanguard

    c4wards

    C4wards directly related to my teaching goals (including Vanguard) C4ward Concierge training I Cubed institute Blackboard Collaborate training Scenarios

    C4wards EEd

    C4wards Engaged in Education CELTT workshops

    C4wards Laulima training SLO initiative Cornerstone initiative

    C4wards Real World Academy

    C4wards, conferences

    C4wards, Engaged in Education, TLC, Laulima training

    Concierge Training, WILD activities, certain C4ward circles

    counselor retreats, C4ward, learning outcomes training,

    Engaged in Education PROMO C4ward CELTT training (too numerous to list)

    Engaged in Education, C4wards

    ePortfolios Curriculum Development Seminars Contract Renewal and Promotion workshops

    Great Teachers conference in Portland Oregon/with site visit Use of IPAD for instruction. Mentoring new Instructor in the O.T.A. program. C4ward increased wellness. Scenarios forTeaching. Developing a FW Educator manual.

    iPad EE WLHE

    Malama Pono Koa Art Gallery New Arts Lectures Mihana La'anau C4ward

    Miha Lana'au C4ward Lecturer's Support C4ward Vanguard

    Problem-based learning C4ward

    Right now, I have to say the C4ward groups that I am a part of.

    Technology for Counselors Counselor Academy PROMO C4ward

    The Contract renewal workshops The wellness C4wards

    TLC, C4ward training,

    Vanguard Faculty Initiative, Real World Academics Workshops, Service Learning Assessment Workshop C4ward

Workshops offered by CELTT C4ward

Writing Across the Curriculum Summer Institute Learning Communities Institute Collaborative Circles for Creative Change (a.k.a. C4wards) Professional Development Leadership Team

CELTT/Tech workshops

Blackboard Collaborate sessions

C4, faculty scenarios, CELTT technology

C4ward, Accreditation, Tools workshops from CELTT

C4wards directly related to my teaching goals (including Vanguard) C4ward Concierge training I Cubed institute Blackboard Collaborate training Scenarios

C4wards Engaged in Education CELTT workshops

CELLT Technology related courses

CELT workshops

Celtt classes in technology

celtt workshops

CSI information sessions. Participate in more in external or system-wide professional development programs. Campus based activities are more instructional slanted

Engaged in Education PROMO C4ward CELTT training (too numerous to list)

Financial Aid; using technology to advise students

Laulima, CELTT courses

MS Office workshops, DE instruction (WebCT, Laulima, Blackboard)

Over the years the technology ones have been very helpful. I now feel comfortable with the technology I use for my classes so I don't feel a need to attend those workshops agan. In the past I did attend 2 or 3 professional development workshops a month and was very satisfied. Now I like the Wild Day attivities because they allow me to meet new people on my campus and they focus on Hawaiian values, well-being and health. They always leave me feeling better and more connected to KCC. Work can be very stressful for many of us so these activities have great value on a personal level.

Real World Academics; CELTT workshops; THINK

Smartthinking - no access if you are not a student. Eluminate - Not much opportunity to use this MS Office (Word, Excel, PowerPoint) Mobile Device Trends Webinar

Tech in student services

Technology for Counselors Counselor Academy PROMO C4ward

Those related to technology and online teaching.

Workshops offered by CELTT C4ward

Conference

Achieving the Dream Conference, Hawaii Strategy Institute (twice), Accelerated Learning Conference

Attendance at Conference Ability to attend webinars

C4wards, conferences

Great Teachers conference in Portland Oregon/with site visit Use of IPAD for instruction. Mentoring new Instructor in the O.T.A. program. C4ward increased wellness. Scenarios forTeaching. Developing a FW Educator manual.

Laulima training (from UH ITS) Scenarios Online National conference Contract renewal workshops

the Excellence in Education conferences

Contract Renewal & Tenure Promotion workshop

ePortfolios Curriculum Development Seminars Contract Renewal and Promotion workshops

Laulima training (from UH ITS) Scenarios Online National conference Contract renewal workshops

The Contract renewal workshops The wellness C4wards

Counselor

counselor retreats, C4ward, learning outcomes training,

Technology for Counselors Counselor Academy PROMO C4ward

Curriculum

ePortfolios Curriculum Development Seminars Contract Renewal and Promotion workshops

Laulima Workshops New Student Orientation New Faculty Orientation Curriculum Workshops

Department workshop/events

Dept sponsored events

Engaged in Education Distance Learning Certificate Real World in Academics ENG 100 Bootcamp

Scenarios On line class Culinary workshops

The Visioning Workshops by Dean O'Hagan

Distance education related technology workshops/training

C4wards Laulima training SLO initiative Cornerstone initiative

C4wards, Engaged in Education, TLC, Laulima training

Celtt Laulima certificate programs

Distance Education Training from CELTT and Mary Hattori Wo Learning Champions with Louise Pagotto TLC with Leigh Dooley

Distance Learning Certification

Engaged in Education Distance Learning Certificate Real World in Academics ENG 100 Bootcamp

KCC Online connection

Laulima courses Elliminate

Laulima training

Laulima training (from UH ITS) Scenarios Online National conference Contract renewal workshops

Laulima Workshops New Student Orientation New Faculty Orientation Curriculum Workshops

Laulima, CELTT courses

MS Office workshops, DE instruction (WebCT, Laulima, Blackboard)

Online class that also met in face to face class

Online Education

Scenarios On line class Culinary workshops

Smartthinking - no access if you are not a student. Eluminate - Not much opportunity to use

this MS Office (Word, Excel, PowerPoint) Mobile Device Trends Webinar

The distance learning program where I learned many aspects of laulima and web page construction. WAC summer institute.

The online teaching workshop offered last Fall. Blackboard collaboration Faculty Home Page

Those related to technology and online teaching.

Engaged in Education

C4ward Concierge Training Scenarios Engaged in education

C4Ward Engaged Education

C4wards EEd

C4wards Engaged in Education CELTT workshops

C4wards, Engaged in Education, TLC, Laulima training

Engaged in Education

Engaged in Education Distance Learning Certificate Real World in Academics ENG 100 Bootcamp

Engaged in Education PROMO C4ward CELTT training (too numerous to list)

Engaged in Education, C4wards

Learning Community

Learning Communities

Learning Communities Institute Transformed for Learning

New Faculty Orientation

Laulima Workshops New Student Orientation New Faculty Orientation Curriculum Workshops

New Faculty Orientation

None

non of them

None

None.

NSF sponsored activities

1. STEM sponsored conference travel.

AAC&U, SENCER Summer Institute.

C4wards directly related to my teaching goals (including Vanguard) C4ward Concierge training I Cubed institute Blackboard Collaborate training Scenarios

NSF programs

SENCER Design Thinking

Other

AOL Learning

assessment and evaluations career and technical education

C4ward, Accreditation, Tools workshops from CELTT

CSI information sessions. Participate in more in external or system-wide professional development programs. Campus based activities are more instructional slanted

Great Teachers conference in Portland Oregon/with site visit Use of IPAD for instruction. Mentoring new Instructor in the O.T.A. program. C4ward increased wellness. Scenarios forTeaching. Developing a FW Educator manual.

In the area of International Student Programs. Travel internationally

Informal support within discipline/with colleagues to brainstorm and implement programs/initiatives, learn from one another, etc.

Kahikoluamea and Academy Projects

Laulima Workshops New Student Orientation New Faculty Orientation Curriculum Workshops

Malama Pono Koa Art Gallery New Arts Lectures Mihana La'anau C4ward

Pacific Islands Geriatric Education Center Train the Trainer Course

Planning Professional Development Workshop for colleagues in the UH System and presenting at Professional Development Workshop for UH system colleagues.

Power Quality and Implementing Energy Efficiency Workshop

Real World Academics; CELTT workshops; THINK

Safe Zone

USA Funds workshop on Financial Aid - Verification

Real World

C4wards Real World Academy

Engaged in Education Distance Learning Certificate Real World in Academics ENG 100 Bootcamp

Real World Academics; CELTT workshops; THINK

Vanguard Faculty Initiative, Real World Academics Workshops, Service Learning Assessment Workshop C4ward

Scenarios

C4, faculty scenarios, CELTT technology

C4ward Concierge Training Scenarios Engaged in education

C4wards directly related to my teaching goals (including Vanguard) C4ward Concierge training I Cubed institute Blackboard Collaborate training Scenarios

Great Teachers conference in Portland Oregon/with site visit Use of IPAD for instruction. Mentoring new Instructor in the O.T.A. program. C4ward increased wellness. Scenarios forTeaching. Developing a FW Educator manual.

Laulima training (from UH ITS) Scenarios Online National conference Contract renewal workshops

Scenarios On line class Culinary workshops

Service learning institute

Service Learning workshop - several years ago

service-learning institute

Vanguard Faculty Initiative, Real World Academics Workshops, Service Learning Assessment Workshop C4ward

Writing Across the Curriculum Summer Institute Learning Communities Institute Collaborative Circles for Creative Change (a.k.a. C4wards) Professional Development Leadership Team

SLO/Assessment

assessment and evaluations career and technical education

C4wards Laulima training SLO initiative Cornerstone initiative

counselor retreats, C4ward, learning outcomes training,

Understanding the next generation of students Developing assessment tools Student Panel presentations= how students prefer to communicate, their thoughts about online courses, how they are using different types of technology in their lives.

Transformed for learning cohort

C4wards, Engaged in Education, TLC, Laulima training

Distance Education Training from CELTT and Mary Hattori Wo Learning Champions with Louise Pagotto TLC with Leigh Dooley

Learning Communities Institute Transformed for Learning

TLC

TLC, C4ward training,

TLC, S. Pestana had a series of meetings on "strategies I could use on Monday."

Webinar

Attendance at Conference Ability to attend webinars

Smartthinking - no access if you are not a student. Eluminate - Not much opportunity to use this MS Office (Word, Excel, PowerPoint) Mobile Device Trends Webinar

Wo funded PD

Concierge Training, WILD activities, certain C4ward circles

Distance Education Training from CELTT and Mary Hattori Wo Learning Champions with Louise Pagotto TLC with Leigh Dooley

Over the years the technology ones have been very helpful. I now feel comfortable with the technology I use for my classes so I don't feel a need to attend those workshops agan. In the past I did attend 2 or 3 professional development workshops a month and was very satisfied. Now I like the Wild Day attivities because they allow me to meet new people on my campus and they focus on Hawaiian values, well-being and health. They always leave me feeling better and more connected to KCC. Work can be very stressful for many of us so these activities have great value on a personal level.

Wo Day

Writing across curriculum

The distance learning program where I learned many aspects of laulima and web page construction. WAC summer institute.

Writing across the Curriculum

Writing Across the Curriculum Summer Institute Learning Communities Institute Collaborative Circles for Creative Change (a.k.a. C4wards) Professional Development Leadership Team

Question 13: How would you evaluate the professional development offerings at KCC?

non-participation

workload issue

Busyness is a major hindrance to the full success of those professional development offerings. Many participants are motivated but have difficulties attending or preparing for those professional development offerings.

I have been interested in several C4ward groups, but being a full-time grad student limits my availability when it comes to meetings.

I have beren tempted to join one of these. It seems that work/life can be very hectic these days. I have found ways (exercise, hiking, music) that I do outside of work to try to stay balanced so that I can do the best job possible at work.

I would like to participate in more professional development offerings, including C4wards, but due the teaching load my time is limited.

Lack of timeliness is my own fault for not having enough time in my busy schedule.

Past few years have been too busy with teaching and campus committee work to have time for professional development.

Same comment above, These groups do not fit into my schedule and outside training is not supported by the college.

Teaching load does not allow for full participation in professional development without personal sacrifice of time.

there are too many committee meetings on campus the c4w seems only to add to the stress of having to be on many committees.

accessibility issue

Although there are excellent professional development opportnities available on campus, I am under the impression that most are available to only faculty; or are primarily focused toward faculty. If there are opportunities available for both faculty and staff, or primarily for staff, then I would like to learn more about them through both the KCC Bulletin, email list serves and other forms of mass communication, as well as from colleagues through word of mouth.   I wish to partcipate in a mentorship program, as there is a steep learning curve to overcome when it comes to navigating campus policies and procedures.

Being on another island and campus make it difficult to attend some professional development offerings

I would like to see more professional development that is specifically for counseling faculty. So much of what is offered is for instructional faculty and it's not always easy to "translate" to what we do.   There hasn't been an assessment done in a long time on what is needed for counseling faculty and that would be a great first step. Time and encouragement to do professional development would also be appreciated. Sometimes I feel guilty that I'm taking time to improve my practice. Too much of professional development seems to be focused on "checking the boxes" and not enough on what would really make significant change happen. There is no overview or "big picture" plan. It seems like national conferences are only offered to a few counselors. Why are the same ones being given opportunities and not others?

It is for Faculty

More difficult for KCC-affiliated faculty who are actually teaching on other islands.

Most of the PD offerings seem to be targeting Instructional faculty.

The limitations for C4wards were not generally known even though I was encouraged to attend. When the guidelines were emailed, I did not meet the minimum qualifications to attend.

new or transient status

As an adjunct, I do not spend much time on campus. I have 1 online and 1 caps based .

I am currently filling in for a lecturer that was unable to fullfil her duties. My home campus is LCC

I am new to the campus. For this reason I have not had the opportunity to participate. I would certainly consider being a participant as I continue as a instructor at KCC.

New lecturer, possibly temporary position.

communication issue

I signed up for three C4ward circles but was never contacted. One was cancelled.

Staff (e.g., librarians, celtt center, etc.) are accessible, knowledgeable, and helpful. I often find myself experiencing unpleasant interactions with faculty, however. Many, not all, come with empty promises of help and have an "I'm above it all" demeanor. Therefore, participating in professional development offerings is met with a level of hesitation for me personally. I did sign up for a C4wards this past semester but have yet to be contacted via email(?). I should probably take the initiative to look into it myself.

awareness issue

I am not sure if I am aware of all available opportunities. I would like to know more information about all the professional development being offered on campus.

no participation

No experience with it so can't evaluate.

Suggestion

Suggestion

Although there are excellent professional development opportnities available on campus, I am under the impression that most are available to only faculty; or are primarily focused toward faculty. If there are opportunities available for both faculty and staff, or primarily for staff, then I would like to learn more about them through both the KCC Bulletin, email list serves and other forms of mass communication, as well as from colleagues through word of mouth.   I wish to partcipate in a mentorship program, as there is a steep learning curve to overcome when it comes to navigating campus policies and procedures.

I would like more opportunities to take seminars to improve learning about teaching during the summer.

I would like to see more professional development that is specifically for counseling faculty. So much of what is offered is for instructional faculty and it's not always easy to "translate" to what we do. There hasn't been an assessment done in a long time on what is needed for counseling faculty and that would be a great first step. Time and encouragement to do professional development would also be appreciated. Sometimes I feel guilty that I'm taking time to improve my practice. Too much of professional development seems to be focused on "checking the boxes" and not enough on what would really make significant change happen.

There is no overview or "big picture" plan. It seems like national conferences are only offered to a few counselors. Why are the same ones being given opportunities and not others?

Individual faculty development projects need to be supported. The STEM program exists because the NSF recognizes and funds programs that involve community college students in the research as an advance learning process. However, only the students are supported, even though the faculty are providing the student-research experiences with no support for the work or for actual research. Performing research goes far beyond conducting experiments (writing grants, IRB, ORS, lab space and facilities, equipment, budgets, ...), so to actually know research requires being directly involved. Research projects allow students to get involved in the reality of the process and learn all aspects of what is needed to succeed. Research in a specific scientific field constitutes an advanced form of faculty development, that needs to be recognized and support.

More consolidation to maximize participants?

The FDC serves to facilitate development, but the process is too complicated and human resources can be difficult in this process. Most development opportunities don't seem to take into account the needs of the faculty, a more logical approach would be to assess the ongoing needs of the faculty and begin from there.

There needs to be a great effort made or a center/office to promote and coordinate these activities

Wish I could participate in more. Will be serving as concierge in the upcoming period. Perhaps recommendation of change of names such as concierge so that it clearly delineates the roles for those who are going for promotion, etc, it is clearer for reviewer and will not be dismissed as non-essential professional development.

With CELTT under construction it appears that PD on campus has reduced significantly. I appreciated the workshops for short, immediate changes rather than the extensive distance learning certificate (this is great, but contains a big committment) that is currently presented.

Positive

Positive

good job.

I enjoy lectures' support that how can we improve with Students.

I feel very fortunate to work at KCC because there are so many useful professional development opportunities. Furthermore, the administration has been very supportive providing me with opportunities to learn new things.

Susan Banner Inouye and Leigh Dooley are AMAZING.

The ones I have participated in have been excellent.

the PD offered at KCC is really good. no complaints. i wish there were more funding available to attend conferences, conventions and workshops out of state, though

There is a C4ward for just about everything. And if there is a need for another one, then I one can get trained as a concierge and start one!

Negative

Negative

C-4 wards are not as active as administrators would believe and they don't usually have much impact outside their groups. Some are disconnected to the mission of the College and

some just don't seem productive from viewing (or not viewing because there was none) their poster sessions.

C4Ward is waist of time and resources, it is like kids playing kid games

I see C4wards to be a way of convening meetings under another name and a kind of reincarnation of 4Ts.

Same comment above, These groups do not fit into my schedule and outside training is not supported by the college.

The FDC serves to facilitate development, but the process is too complicated and human resources can be difficult in this process. Most development opportunities don't seem to take into account the needs of the faculty, a more logical approach would be to assess the ongoing needs of the faculty and begin from there.

The only problem is that we don't have enough concierge to run all the suggested C4wards. But if we ran them all, there would be too many.

The treatment of lecturers is a very serious issue at KCC.

Not directly related

Other

0

I appreciate the other veteran faculty members and would look forward to new math faculty at the college.

In the beginning of the survey I identified myself as staff and yet the questions I was asked were geared towards teaching. What was the point of that?

Several workshops are offered when I am conducting workshops myself.

Question 14: What knowledge and skills would you like to learn through professional development offerings at KCC?

Technology

technology in general

I like their offerings. Technology is always a good area.

I would like to learn more computer related products that will enhance my teaching

IT, Human Resources Management

more efficient use of technology

More professional development offerings related to technology, eportfolios, etc.

Technological

Technology classes in the mornings on website maintenance, keeping up with technology to improve communication and marketing of classes.

Technology Skills, What services available on campus, web development, video editing,

Technology, Students, and learning methods

time management new learning strategies new technology

Workshops on Dossier Computer clases

iPad

Everything I can think of is covered, I just don't have time to do it all. I would love to learn to use the iPad and its applications to teaching, but can't make the time to go to that C4ward. Maybe I need a time management/prioritizing skill-building C4ward!

Further use of technology, Interactive/ easy to use Use of the Apple computer/integrated with IPAD documentation.

How to do more Laulima stuff (i.e. gradebook). How to be innovative with my iPad.

Ipad2 with my course with students I need to learn how at KCC.

web development/maintenance

Skills related to secondary duties, such as running meetings, planning events, project management. Introduction to learning resources online in areas such as programming, web development, etc. by people who have used these resources.

Technology classes in the mornings on website maintenance, keeping up with technology to improve communication and marketing of classes.

Technology Skills, What services available on campus, web development, video editing,

Software

Emerging Educational Technology software platforms.

Updated software programs

classroom technology

Improve my use of classroom technology. Training or workshops on how to work with and address the needs of student's with disabilities in my classes.

life balance, technology in the classroom, CAT or other assessment techniques especially for tenure/promotion or contract renewal

Eportfolio

More professional development offerings related to technology, eportfolios, etc.

video editing

Technology Skills, What services available on campus, web development, video editing,

digital literature

online pedagogy (the Online Pedagogy C4ward no longer exists); digital literature; literature reading club

Programming

Skills related to secondary duties, such as running meetings, planning events, project management. Introduction to learning resources online in areas such as programming, web development, etc. by people who have used these resources.

Laulima

How to do more Laulima stuff (i.e. gradebook). How to be innovative with my iPad.

Media

Using other media teaching devices

Pedagogy

teaching/learning techniques/strategies

assessment skills, instructor tools

creative pedagogy

How to make programs and courses relevant to current community and business needs.

I would love to engage in the entire program. After 28 years of teaching experience I have a a tendency to let myself live in a rut as a teacher rather than living in a world of new and fresh formats for teaching and learning contracts. I am currently completing my EdD at Argosy U in support of my desire to find a full time teaching position.

Mechanics of teaching, grading, etc

Mental health guide lines New faculty need a course on how to teach

more on Engagement... not necessarily to "learn" about it, but just an opportunity to talk to other faculty about engaging students

More problem-based learning techniques.

Skills to improve F2F and online delivery

Teaching students to write (I am planning to attend WAC Summer Institute)

Technology, Students, and learning methods

time management new learning strategies new technology

Wish there was a well indexed video library of effective classroom techniques.

online pedagogy

How to teach online

online pedagogy (the Online Pedagogy C4ward no longer exists); digital literature; literature reading club

Skills to improve F2F and online delivery

College processes/Resources

access resources/people

How better to access resources/people available on campus to assist me with projects/ideas.

Technology Skills, What services available on campus, web development, video editing,

processing travel

How to actually improve the process of travel, travel funds and purchasing for the faculty.

maximizing benefits

Better balancing of personal and professional life. Working with student employees. Maximizing offered benefits. Social change for a better campus.

work with administration

Problem resolution How to talk with administration

business oriented non-credit courses

Some of the short (2-5 session) business oriented non-credit courses could be offered. They would help with skills but I don't want to pay $60+ for a class, nor do I want to attend a class 6-9 pm when I get off at 4:30. Oh, and then you would have to tell us about it.

planning and project management

Skills related to secondary duties, such as running meetings, planning events, project management. Introduction to learning resources online in areas such as programming, web development, etc. by people who have used these resources.

Dossier

Workshops on Dossier Computer clases

research support

Grant-writing, research support.

grant writing

Grant-writing, research support.

accreditation, tactical plan writing

Help with program accreditation, tactical plan writing

working with student employees

Better balancing of personal and professional life. Working with student employees. Maximizing offered benefits. Social change for a better campus.

impact administerative decisions

How to positively impact Administrative decisions.

Life Management

health & wellness/life balance/stress management

Better balancing of personal and professional life. Working with student employees. Maximizing offered benefits. Social change for a better campus.

Health and Wellness

leadership, communication, stress management, first aid, paraprofessional crisis management, building and managing partnerships.

life balance, technology in the classroom, CAT or other assessment techniques especially for tenure/promotion or contract renewal

Mental health guide lines New faculty need a course on how to teach

time management exercise stress reduction

time management

Everything I can think of is covered, I just don't have time to do it all. I would love to learn to use the iPad and its applications to teaching, but can't make the time to go to that C4ward. Maybe I need a time management/prioritizing skill-building C4ward!

time management exercise stress reduction

time management new learning strategies new technology

first aid

leadership, communication, stress management, first aid, paraprofessional crisis management, building and managing partnerships.

Communication

conflict management

conflict management and resolution

Managing student disruptions. Dealing with disruptive students. Handling/troubleshooting situations. Students with differing learning needs. Greater DSSO integration. LGBTI issues on campus.

Problem resolution How to talk with administration

student leadership development, conflict resolution across cultures, facilitation skills

Working with difficult supervisors and/or departments.

build and managing partnerships

leadership, communication, stress management, first aid, paraprofessional crisis management, building and managing partnerships.

Networking

More networking opportunities, both with faculty members and academics, as well as private industry individuals.

Assessment

Assessment

assessment and evaluation

assessment skills, instructor tools

How to assess programs and class learning in a supportive way that encourages not only the teacher but the students to understand the results of the assessment and how to keep track of it.

Learn more about evidence-based assessment strategies

less cumbersome methods to assessment student learning

life balance, technology in the classroom, CAT or other assessment techniques especially for tenure/promotion or contract renewal

Leadership

social change

Better balancing of personal and professional life. Working with student employees. Maximizing offered benefits. Social change for a better campus.

How to design change.

Leadership

How to be a more effective leader

leadership, communication, stress management, first aid, paraprofessional crisis management, building and managing partnerships.

Non-teaching as primary duty skill development

non-teaching faculty

Knowledge and skills for non-teaching faculty

human resource management

IT, Human Resources Management
continuing education/students
Knowledge and skills related to continuing education courses and students
counseling skills
Updates on counseling skills...what's the latest research? What's working for students? How do we integrate that into our everyday practice? What's happening on the national stage?
N/A

N/A
0
N/A
Student needs

students with different learning needs
Managing student disruptions. Dealing with disruptive students. Handling/troubleshooting situations. Students with differing learning needs. Greater DSSO integration. LGBTI issues on campus.
understanding student diversity
Better understanding about student diversity issues
students with disability
Improve my use of classroom technology. Training or workshops on how to work with and address the needs of student's with disabilities in my classes.
Scholarship

Scholarship
Academic publication and support.
More discipline specific professional development. More emphasis on both professional and student scholarship.
courses in discipline
Courses specific to our field. More specialized or more advanced.
LGBTI

LGBTI
How to support LGBT students, staff and faculty through creating a climate of openness and non-judgement at KCC
Managing student disruptions. Dealing with disruptive students. Handling/troubleshooting situations. Students with differing learning needs. Greater DSSO integration. LGBTI issues on campus.
Student development

student leadership development
student leadership development, conflict resolution across cultures, facilitation skills
effective student mentoship
Effective mentoring, what is it, how can it be implemented, what are the assessments for both mentor and the student receiving mentorship.
Other

A variety.
Got what I need.

APPENDIX 4. QUESTION 15 OPEN-ENDED RESPONSES

Question 15: What suggestions do you have for Professional Development Leadership Team to improve C4ward initiative?

n/a, none, or not related

    n/a, none, or not related

        0

        I would suggest that the Professional Development Leadership Team spell "initiative" correctly :-)

        n/a

        No comment

        No suggestions at the moment. C4ward leader is very approachable and I would just make suggestions directly to her.

        None

        None.

        Offer courses in the evening or on weekends

        This is the first time that I have heard of this program and I am interested in what is happening.

Structure

    Ongoing reflection

        suggest more structured goals (the c4ward wouldn't be required to meet them, but they would give something to aim for.) Maybe do require ongoing reflection?

    More groups

        Have more interesting groups and open it to staff

    build connection with student success

        Need to build the connection with student success.

    change "concierge"

        Recommendation of change of names such as "concierge" so that it clearly delineates the roles for those who are going for promotion, etc, it is clearer for reviewer and will not be dismissed as non-essential professional development. Thank you to each of you for your outstanding job!

    more organized

        Be more organized

    Fewer meetings

        Fewer meetings. Maybe once a month rather than two.

    structured goals

        suggest more structured goals (the c4ward wouldn't be required to meet them, but they would give something to aim for.) Maybe do require ongoing reflection?

    keep it informal

        Keep it voluntary and informal. This helps to keep out the bureaucracy that stifles many systemic initiatives.

    less assessment

        less cumbersome methods of assessment

Communication/Marketing

more advertising/informercial

Advertising and more advertising.

Better advertising about how to participate and about the program in general. A couple of colleagues have emailed the concierge of the groups and they never responded to them. Its a great idea, but needs to be better advertised.

more marketing of the C4Awards circle especially vis email blast

Perhaps a brief infomercial at every Fall convocation?

Unknown - Communication of what the program is all about? Question: Dog Owners seem out of place in the list of Pro Development

create a website

If there is no website, create a website.

publish a participant list

Is there a group list for C4ward participants? this would be a great way to ask questions, offer resources, and share best practices.

more marketing to staff

Let staff know. The only thing I knew about C4ward was that it was something that was given to to faculty, but I am not sure for what.

Content

bring expert in instructional strategy

Bring outside speakers and workshop facilitators doing programs for faculty in the areas of instructional strategy. Would be great to see administration participate with faculty and staff in professional development programs.

Student-driven topics

Student-driven topics--since students are supposedly the indirect beneficiary of C4wards. How can they result in policy change on campus?

share learning

I feel that C4ward is doing a lot right! But it would be great to have a more focused offering that was really meaningful. How about a conference on the March Prof Dev day that brought learnings from each group together?

direct job applicable PD

Applied directly to teaching, counseling, staff skill development so that they an do their job better.

work with HR

How to be patient and efficient in working with HR

faculty reflection

Help faculty critique themselves in terms of their methods and pedagogy, and then show them how to make substantive change that goes along with how to teach diverse, first-generation in College students, i.e. collaborative, hands on, team work, making change in communities, etc.

offer occasional shorter-term PD

I believe the PDL Team is already extremely responsive to our input. Perhaps be open to offering and supporting occasional, shorter-term professional development opportunities.

good job/continue the effort

    good job/continue the effort

I like what they are doing. I also like the tone of their approach.

Keep up the excellent work, and expand your activities to include staff more. Targeted representation and inclusion of support staff.

Keep up the good work.

Please continue your efforts. They are not unnoticed.

Recommendation of change of names such as "concierge" so that it clearly delineates the roles for those who are going for promotion, etc, it is clearer for reviewer and will not be dismissed as non-essential professional development. Thank you to each of you for your outstanding job!

Membership

    open to staff

Have more interesting groups and open it to staff

Keep up the excellent work, and expand your activities to include staff more. Targeted representation and inclusion of support staff.

Provide Professional Development Programs for non- teaching faculty

Put staff in charge

    have administration participate

Bring outside speakers and workshop facilitators doing programs for faculty in the areas of instructional strategy. Would be great to see administration participate with faculty and staff in professional development programs.

Time

    designated time for C4 mtg

A designated reserved time slot for C4wards to meet.

Time for circles to gather. So many interesting circles, but not enough time to participate.

    Flexible schedule for concierge training

offer a more flexible schedule for concierge trainings-- the timing is difficult to make for non-instructional faculty

Survey of needs

Support

    More administrative encouragement/support

Have administrative response to the C4ward goals and/or suggestions. Our C4ward was disheartened by a lack of administrative support after presenting our ideas.

    Incentive

Have observed spotty participation ... more incentives may be helpful.

end it